
STRUCTURING AND FOSTERING TRADITIONAL MARKETS, SHOPPING CENTERS, AND MODERN STORES AT THE COMMUNITY INCOME LEVEL

Siti Fatimah¹, Nadia Nisa Aulia², Miftahul Jannah³, Siti Khumayah⁴, Aghnia Dian Lestari⁵

Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon, Indonesia

E-mail: sf.sitifatihmah29@gmail.com¹, nadianisaaulia789@gmail.com²,
mj607407@gmail.com³, siti.khumayah@ugj.ac.id⁴, aghnia.dianl@ugj.ac.id⁵

KEYWORDS

Public Policy;
Traditional Market;
Market Arrangement

ABSTRACT

The market is a medium for bartering between the needs of sellers and buyers where sellers expect profits while buyers expect efficiency at very affordable prices. The purpose of this study is to explore the changes in the arrangement and guidance as well as the impact on the income level of the community after the fire. This research used a qualitative method with a case study approach. Three data collection techniques were used including observation, interview, and documentation. The research findings show that the authorized parties in implementing the policy are only the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office. In terms of structuring, it is divided based on 3 elements, namely dry, semi, and wet zones. Based on Public Policy, structuring, and coaching have been implemented in accordance with government policy and in accordance with existing data. Policy Stakeholders have been well implemented, but not optimal because the traders are still not orderly and consumer interest is more to the marketplace making it easier for them to shop and more efficient in terms of time and expenses. Policy Environment has been well implemented, because it makes it easier for traders and consumers when selling and shopping. The conclusion of the impact on the income of business actors decreased due to a lot of competitiveness.

INTRODUCTION

According to the definition in the Big Indonesian Dictionary (Mahiryanto, 2014), a market is a location where sellers aim to exchange goods or services for money while buyers aim to exchange money for goods or services. Markets and traditional markets are regulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia Number 21 of 2021 concerning guidelines for the development and management of trade facilities which is implemented through Cirebon Regent Regulation Number 9 of 2016 concerning Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores. The arrangement and guidance aim to increase the income of the local community. Traditional markets refer to markets that are established and run by various parties, such as government agencies, local governments, private entities, and state-owned enterprises, as well as partnerships between

the public and private sectors. These markets consist of various types of business premises, such as shops, kiosks, Los, and lemparakan that are owned or managed by traders of various levels, ranging from small, and medium, to community initiatives or cooperatives. These traditional markets usually have a small scale of business, limited capital, and use a bargaining process in buying and selling merchandise. The growth of minimarkets, supermarkets, and hypermarkets in the region has had a major impact on the community, both socially and economically. The market is a medium for bartering between the needs of sellers and buyers where sellers expect profits while buyers expect efficiency at very affordable prices. Traditional buildings are given priority or primacy in their use for markets that have been established for two decades, markets that have experienced fires, faced the impact of post-natural disasters, and social conflicts, as well as affected areas that have great trade potential. The Cirebon Regency Regional Government is structuring and fostering the Sumber traditional market with the aim of improving the welfare of traders, increasing their profitability, and encouraging the Sumber market to compete with other markets.

According to the provisions in Regulation of the Minister of Trade No. 21 of 2021 concerning guidelines for the construction and management of trade facilities, the second section describes the criteria for the construction of trade facilities. This section consists of paragraphs that discuss the criteria for the construction of public markets, which are regulated in Article 8 paragraph 4 as follows: (a) Type A public markets must operate every day, have at least 400 traders, and have a minimum land area of 5,000m² (b) Type B public markets must operate at least 3 times a week, have at least 275 traders and a minimum land area of 4,000m² (c) Type C public markets must operate at least 2 times a week, have at least 200 traders and a minimum land area of 3,000m² (d) Type D public markets must operate at least 1 time a week, have at least 100 traders, and a minimum land area of 2,000m².

Physically, the condition of the Sumber traditional market compared to other markets in Cirebon Regency is very different because, on August 15, 2015, there was a fire that resulted in the condition of the market being burned to the ground. As a result of the fire, traders were moved to a temporary market adjacent to Sumber Market. The condition of the traditional market is inseparable from the spatial arrangement in it, including the spatial arrangement in the building of stalls, los, stalls, and other transaction places. One of the changes and improvements that can be made by traditional markets can be through physical rearrangement and traditional market management.

Table 1
Names of Markets in Cirebon Regency

No	Market Name
1	Market Ciledug
2	Market Babakan
3	Market Cipeujeuh
4	Market Sumber

5	Market Kue Weru
6	Market Pasalaran
7	Market Batik Trusmi
8	Market Jamblang
9	Market Palimanan

Source: Market Data Recapitulation Source 2023

Of the 9 (nine) markets, researchers are more focused on studying or examining the Sumber Market because the Sumber market is included in the Type A people's market criteria because the Sumber Market has a land area of 5,000m², a building area of 4,000m² and the number of traders still operating is 413. According to the researcher's view, initially, the condition of the source market was not well organized, but after the renewal of the arrangement and development of the source market, it was more well organized, in terms of buying and selling interest, this was due to high competitiveness such as the many marketplaces that made it easy for buyers to shop practically and the many itinerant vegetable traders who made it easier for buyers to reduce expenses. Therefore, researchers are interested in conducting research that will focus more on the level of community income.



Figure 1
Comparison of the State of Sumber Market Before and After Post-Fire

Generally, this development only focuses on the physical improvement of the market without considering the internal organization of the market itself. The physical development of the market can be seen from the improvement of buildings such as kiosks, los, lemprakan, and PTT which are more organized. The first floor is dominated by clothing, sandals and shoes, accessories, and office stationery (stationery) traders. Furthermore, the second floor is occupied by traders of vegetables, fruits, groceries, eggs, chicken, beef, goats, and herbal medicine traders.

Table 2
Location of Market Buildings Source

No	location	Type
1	1st floor	vegetables, fruits, groceries, eggs, chicken, beef, goat, and herbal medicine vendors.
2	2st floor	clothing, sandals and shoes, accessories, and office stationery (stationary)

Source: Market Data Recapitulation Source 2023

After the construction process, the spatial layout of the source market has four types of trading spaces, namely kiosks, los, lemparakan, and PTT with a total of 669 units of trading space.

Table 3
Types of Trading Spaces in the Sumber Market

No	Type of Trading Room	Total Venue	Status Pedagang		
			Open	Open and close	Close
1	Kios	80	49	18	13
2	Los	313	202	24	87
3	Lemprakan	176	122	10	44
4	PTT	100	40	26	34
	Jumlah	669	413	78	178

Source: Market Data Recapitulation Source 2023

The table records a total of 669 units of trading spaces, but most of them have closed down. Only 413 units of trading space are still actively running their businesses. In the Sumber Traditional Market, there are still many closed lots from the four types of trading spaces and traders choose to trade using the lemprakan type of trading space. Sumber Market already has good infrastructure and facilities. One of the objectives of structuring and coaching is to renew and improve the quality of a place, as well as allow slump traders to utilize the facilities that have been provided.

The policy of regulating the governance of the Sumber traditional market, which is included in the management by the Cirebon Regency government, aims to create a more modern traditional market. This is expected to improve the convenience of services to consumers and consumers get better quality goods.

Based on this, the research focus can be focused on issues related to the impact of Cirebon Regent Regulation Number 9 of 2016 on the arrangement and guidance of traditional markets, shopping centers, and modern stores which are more focused on the level of community income in Sumber Market. In previous research, namely by, (Umam, 2019) entitled "Analysis of the Effectiveness of the Traditional Market Revitalization Program at Grengseng Market, Paguyangan District, Brebes Regency", showed that of the six indicators studied, namely program socialization, profit or income, growth, efficiency, satisfaction, and morale. Four indicators have proven effective, namely profit or income, growth, satisfaction, and morale. However, two indicators, namely program socialization and efficiency, have not yet reached the desired level of effectiveness. Thus, overall, the revitalization program in Grengseng Market can be considered successful because the majority of the objectives of the revitalization program have been achieved.

According to research conducted by (Lutfiana, 2020) with the title "The Effectiveness of the Traditional Market Revitalization Program in Increasing Trader Income: A Case Study of Setono Betek Market, Kediri City", found that the results of the study showed the following: (1) After the implementation of the revitalization program, the condition of the Setono Betek market in Kediri City has increased significantly from the previous condition. Although the main responsibility in maintaining market facilities and infrastructure is still the obligation of

the developer, the UPT market also tries to participate in the maintenance. Almost all physical aspects in Pasar Setono Betek experienced a satisfactory increase. (2) In terms of traders' income, market revitalization has a significant positive impact on Pasar Setono Betek, Kediri City. The level of effectiveness of this revitalization is considered high based on the intensity of the results achieved. This is because the market manager remains compliant with the rules that apply in market management, and traders also show a high level of awareness in creating a market that is able to compete.

According to (Umam, 2019), the evaluation of the revitalization program at Pasar Grengseng, Paguyangan District, Brebes Regency shows the effectiveness of the program, especially in achieving indicators of profit or income, growth, satisfaction, and overall morale. Meanwhile, according to (Lutfiana, 2020), the revitalization program at Setono Betek Market, Kediri City has brought significant improvements in the maintenance of market facilities and infrastructure, with a good contribution from the UPT market. Almost all physical aspects of the market have improved satisfactorily, and this revitalization has had a positive impact on income and the types of goods traded in the market. Market managers and traders also show a high level of awareness in complying with the new market rules.

Thus the researcher is interested in examining the reforms in this study by utilizing a qualitative approach. The purpose of this study is to explore the changes in the arrangement and guidance as well as the impact on the income level of the community after the fire. This is intended to improve the competitiveness of Sumber Market with other Modern Markets in the Cirebon Regency area, as well as to improve service quality and accessibility for the community. This research also aims to evaluate the impact of Cirebon Regent Regulation No. 9/2016 on the income level of the community and to improve the competitiveness of the Sumber Traditional Market with other modern markets around it.

METHOD RESEARCH

The method applied in this research is a qualitative method with a case study approach. According to (Hermawan, 2019), "The case study research method is an appropriate strategy for use in research that uses the main research question of how or why, the researcher has little time to control the events under study, and the research focus is a contemporary phenomenon, to track contemporary events." In the case study method, researchers focus on the design and implementation of research. In the case study method, researchers focus on the design and implementation of research".

In this research, a qualitative data analysis method was used. Matthew B. Milles and A. Michael Huberman in (S. Sugiyono, 2012) explain that the qualitative data analysis process is carried out interactively and continuously until the data reaches saturation. This data analysis activity includes data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing.

1. Data Reduction: Reducing data means combining, selecting key things, emphasizing crucial aspects, and identifying emerging themes and patterns. Technically, the data reduction process in this study includes recapitulating the results of interviews and analyzing the results of documents that are relevant to the research focus (S. Sugiyono, 2012).

2. Data Presentation (Data Display): In this research, the data will be presented in various ways such as in the form of narrative text, tables, photos, or charts (S. Sugiyono, 2012).
3. Conclusion Drawing: The process of drawing conclusions in this research involves a discussion between the findings in the field and the theories related to this research (S. Sugiyono, 2012).

Based on (P. D. Sugiyono, 2009), qualitative research utilizes data collection in natural settings (natural conditions), uses primary data sources, and emphasizes more on observation, interview, and documentation techniques. In this study, three data collection methods are: (1) Observation involves a process consisting of various biological and psychological aspects, with the main focus on observation and memory. (2) An interview is a meeting between two individuals to exchange information and ideas through a question-and-answer dialog, allowing the construction of meaning in a particular topic using a semi-structured interview type (3) Documentation includes recording events that occurred in the past.

This method focuses on collecting data that already exists in the Sumber Market, Cirebon Regency, such as institutional profiles, staffing data, organizational structure, and other data relevant to the research. The application of the documentation method in research at the Sumber Market, Cirebon Regency aims to collect supporting data related to research problems. By using documents as one of the data sources, research results from observations and interviews become more credible and accountable.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Arrangement and Development of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores on the Level of Community Income based on Cirebon Regent Regulation Number 9 of 2016 concerning Arrangement and Development of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores includes 3 key elements: Dunn (1994: 71) in Tachjan, 2006 suggests "A policy system, or the overall institutional pattern within which policies are made, involves interrelationships among three elements: public policies, policy stakeholders, and policy environment" (Tachjan, 2006).

Arrangement and Development of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores at the Community Income Level

a. Public policy

Based on the findings of the research conducted by the author, it can be concluded that the Cirebon Regent Regulation No. 9/2016 policy regarding the arrangement and guidance of traditional markets, shopping centers, and modern stores has been successfully implemented effectively. The goal is to ensure that the two entities can grow harmoniously, support each other, and mutually benefit each other. However, in terms of seller and buyer interest, it is not as expected due to high competitiveness such as the many marketplaces that make it easy for buyers to shop practically and the many traveling vegetable traders that make it easier for buyers to reduce expenses.

According to the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office, the main background of the arrangement and guidance was due to the fire on August 15, 2015. The policy objective

of Cirebon Regent Regulation No. 9/2016 was carried out because the condition of the market has met its target in accordance with government policy and existing data in the agency.

The arrangement of the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office in implementing the Cirebon Regent Regulation No. 9/2016 policy on the spatial arrangement of selling goods related to the zoning system already has a division and classification based on 3 elements determined by the agency through the market manager, namely dry, semi and wet zones. At this time the rental system of Kios, Los, and Lemprakan

The Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office in implementing the Cirebon Regent Regulation No. 9/2016 policy guides business actors. Disperindagin directs to complete the legality of business licenses and halal products in food businesses. Implementation of healthy market socialization activities, socialization of market schools within 1 (one) year 3 (three) times socialization, and socialization of market distribution facilities management.

Conditions in the field show that traditional market traders are worried about the presence of modern stores because they think they will lose customers over time. The presence of stores that are very close to traditional markets can lead to intense competition and make traditional markets lose their appeal to the public.

b. Policy Stakeholders

a) Internal

Based on the findings of the research conducted by the author, according to the "Head of the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office, the authorized parties in the Cirebon Regent Regulation Number 9 of 2016 are the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office".

b) Target Groups

Based on the results of research conducted by the author, the number of trading spaces is 669 spaces and only 413 spaces are currently occupied by traders in the Sumber Traditional Market, Cirebon Regency.

The hope is that this arrangement and guidance will be carried out:

- 1) More decent place to sell
- 2) Traders are more organized
- 3) Consumers give positive responses to the facilities and infrastructure available at the Sumber Traditional Market, Cirebon Regency.
- 4) Increase consumer purchasing power

The management and arrangement of traditional markets are already quite good, and it is hoped that this program will be able to maintain the sustainability of traditional markets amid the rapid development of modern stores. With effective market management, the government can increase local revenue from retribution in traditional markets.

c. Policy environment

Based on the results of research conducted by the author, the existing data on access for traders, buyers, and distribution of goods is currently adequate with the loading dock above and below for access to the distribution of goods such as the entry and exit of vehicles and trolleys. In this case, the arrangement of stalls, stalls, and stalls has been arranged neatly

and cleanly and the security of traders and buyers has been maximized because of the parking area facilities using a manless automatic parking system.

According to research conducted by the author in a study conducted by (Permana et al., 2022) Supervision is an element of the internal control system that is carried out through continuous monitoring actions, involving routine management activities, supervision, comparison, reconciliation, and other actions related to the implementation of tasks. Separate evaluations are carried out through internal assessments, reviews, and tests of the effectiveness of the internal control system which can be carried out by the government's internal control apparatus or external parties using an internal control checklist. Follow-up on recommendations resulting from audits and other reviews must be carried out immediately and carried out in accordance with the procedures for resolving recommendations from audits and other reviews that have been established.

The Impact of Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores on Community Income Levels

Based on the findings of the research that the author conducted, the arrangement of the traditional source market according to the existing data access for traders, buyers, and the distribution of goods is currently adequate with the loading dock above and below for access to the distribution of goods such as the entry and exit of vehicles and trolleys. In this case, the arrangement of stalls, stalls, and stalls has been neatly arranged and clean and the security of traders and buyers has been maximized because the parking area is facilitated by using a manless automatic parking system. Guidance provided by the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office by conducting coaching including healthy market socialization and market school socialization within 1 (one) year three times.

a. Negative Impacts of Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores

Based on the findings of the research that the authors conducted, the obstacles that hinder the implementation of Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores, namely, the funding budget submitted by the Cirebon Regency Trade and Industry Office is the most important thing in structuring and coaching but the submission period until disbursement takes approximately 5 (five) working days from the time of submission and limited budget structuring and coaching, The limited quality of employees is still lacking in the implementation of Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, in terms of structuring there are stairs that are too high and steep which results in the community or buyers feeling uncomfortable shopping on the 2nd (second) floor so they choose to shop outside the market, in terms of coaching after socialization many business actors and the community are still not open-minded, lack of self-awareness and many business actors who do not comply with the policies that have been enacted from thus hampering the objectives of this policy.

b. Positive Impact of Structuring and Coaching Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores

Based on the findings of the research that the authors conducted, the factors that support the process of Structuring and Guiding Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores, namely, the condition of the arrangement of kiosks, los and lemprakans looks tidier, cleanliness is much cleaner and more comfortable, parking is more orderly and the buyers' vehicles are not on the shoulder of the road but in a parking lot that is already available and safe, making the traditional market a very strategic source.

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that the arrangement and guidance of traditional markets have an impact on community income including:

1. Income levels are declining due to high competitiveness such as the many marketplaces that make it easy for shoppers to shop practically and the many traveling vegetable traders that make it easier for shoppers to reduce expenses.
2. Changes in retribution payments that have become more expensive, causing business owners to experience a loss of income from the rental prices of kio, Los, and lemprakan.
3. There are still many business actors who sell in front of the market or on the shoulder of the road which causes a decrease in buyers and the income of business actors who are inside the traditional market of Sumber.

According to the author's research in a study conducted by (Khumayah, 2014) that the arrangement and development of traditional markets can improve community welfare through increased purchasing power and social services in response to increased income levels and community skills.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of research and discussion on the research title "Arrangement and Guidance of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores on Community Income Levels" it can be concluded that the Impact of the Cirebon Regent Regulation on Arrangement and Guidance of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers and Modern Stores on Community Income Levels is not fully optimal. 1) Public Policy has been implemented well and is optimal. Which states that the arrangement and guidance on the traditional market of Sumber Cirebon Regency has been implemented in accordance with government policy and in accordance with existing data. 2) Policy Stakeholders have done well, but not optimal. This states that the enthusiasm of traders in using kiosks, Los, and Lemprakan facilities is still not orderly on policies determined by the Office while the interest of consumers is more to the marketplace which makes it easier for them to shop practically and more efficiently in terms of time and expenses. So it becomes one of the obstacles to policy implementation. 3) The Policy Environment has been implemented well and is optimal. This states that structuring and coaching have a beneficial effect and can make it easier for sellers and buyers when selling and shopping.

Negative impacts in research on the Arrangement and Development of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores, namely, the budget process is quite long, the quality of employees is not optimal, the condition of steep building stairs, there is a lot of competitiveness outside the traditional market sources, lack of self-awareness and compliance of business actors in applicable policies.

The positive impact of research on the Arrangement and Guidance of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores, namely, the condition of the building and arrangement is good and appropriate, cleanliness and comfort are better, parking is more orderly and safe, the source traditional market becomes a very strategic market.

The impact of the Arrangement and Guidance of Traditional Markets, Shopping Centers, and Modern Stores on community income has decreased due to a lot of competitiveness, retribution payments have changed resulting in reduced community income, and there are still business actors who sell on the shoulder of the road so as to reduce the interest of buyers to enter the traditional market source because it is more time efficient and saves parking payment expenses.

REFERENCES

- hermawan, I. (2019). *Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan (Kualitatif, Kuantitatif Dan Mixed Method)*. Hidayatul Quran.
- Khumayah, S. (2014). Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Pimpinan Perguruan Tinggi Yang Berimplikasi Terhadap Peningkatan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat (Studi Kasus Program Dana Bergulir Unswagati Cirebon). *Logika Jurnal Ilmiah Lemlit Unswagati Cirebon*, 11(2).
- Lutfiana, K. Y. (2020). *Efektivitas Program Revitalisasi Pasar Tradisional Dalam Meningkatkan Pendapatan Pedagang (Studi Kasus Pasar Setono Betek Kota Kediri)*. Iain Kediri.
- Permana, I., Siswoyo, M., & Ma'rifat, I. E. (2022). Implementasi Sistem Pengendalian Internal Revitalisasi Pasar Desa Mertapada. *Ganaya: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 5(4), 453–464.
- Sugiyono, P. D. (2009). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif Dan R&D*, Bandung: Cv. Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono, S. (2012). *Qualitative Research Methods And R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tachjan, H. (2006). Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. (No Title).
- Umam, M. C. (2019). *Analisis Efektivitas Program Revitalisasi Pasar Tradisional Di Pasar Grengseng Kecamatan Paguyangan Kabupaten Brebes*. Iain Purwokerto.
- Cirebon, P. D. (2024, Januari 04). *Peraturan Kabupaten Cirebon*. Retrieved From Jdih Kabupaten Cirebon: <https://jdih.cirebonkab.go.id/peraturan/detail/3001>
- Danisworo, M. Dan Martokusumo, W. (2002). "Revitalisasi Kawasan Kota : Sebuah Catatan Dalam Pengembangan Dan Pemanfaatan Kawasan Kota". Info Urdi Vol.13
- Harbani Pasolong, M. (2019). *Teori Administrasi Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Marhiyanto, D.B. (2014). *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta:Victory Inti Cipta
- Masithoh, Siti. 2018. "Pasar Sumber Cirebon Sudah Bisa Ditempati, Pedagang Akan Ikuti Sistem Pengundian". <https://jabar.tribunnews.com/2018/11/08/pasar-sumber-cirebon-sudah-bisa-ditempati-pedagang-akan-ikuti-sistem-pengundian> , Diakses Pada 6 Februari 2024 Pukul 18.40
- Peraturan Bupati Cirebon Nomor 9 Tahun 2016 Tentang Perubahan Atas Peraturan Bupati Cirebon Nomor 108 Tahun 2015 Tentang Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Cirebon Nomor 7 Tahun 2014 Tentang Penataan Dan Pembinaan Pasar Tradisional, Pusat Perbelanjaan Dan Toko Modern.

- Peraturan Menteri Perdagangan Nomor : 21 Tahun 2021 Tentang Pedomaan Pembangunan Dan Pengelolaan Sarana Perdagangan.
- Permendag, R. I. Nomor 70 Tahun 2013 Tentang Pedoman Penataan Dan Pembinaan Pasar Tradisional. *Pusat Perbelanjaan Dan Toko Modern*.
- Peraturan Presiden R.I Nomor 112 Tahun 2007 Tentang Penataan Dan Pembinaan Pasar Tradisional, Pusat Perbelanjaan Dan Toko Modern.
- Rinaldi, R., & Hidayat, Z. (2016). Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Cirebon Nomor 7 Tahun 2014 Tentang Penataan, Pembinaan Pasar Tradisional, Pusat Perbelanjaan Dan Toko Modern. *Journal Of Public Policy And Management Review*, 5(4), 112-129.

Copyright holders:

Siti Fatimah¹, Nadia Nisa Aulia², Miftahul Jannah³, Siti Khumayah⁴, Aghnia Dian Lestari⁵ (2024)

**First publication right:
JoSS - Journal of Social Science**



This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International